

Review of the dissertation for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)

Dissertation title: **Development of creativity of future bachelors of music education in the process of vocal training**

Doctoral
candidate: **Kuldanov Nauryz Talgatovich**

Educational
program: 8D01401 «Music education» /8D01402 «Music performance and pedagogy»

1. General characteristics of the dissertation

N. Kuldanov's dissertation is devoted to a problem of great pedagogical and cultural significance – the development of creativity of future bachelors of music education during vocal training.

The topic is directly related to the priorities of modern higher education in Kazakhstan and abroad, since music pedagogy today requires not only the technical training of performers, but also the formation of flexible, creative and reflective professionals capable of transmitting artistic values to future generations. The aim of the study is clearly formulated: to develop, substantiate and experimentally test a methodology for developing the creativity of future bachelors of music education in the process of vocal training.

The dissertation has a logical structure, includes theoretical and experimental parts, and demonstrates the author's awareness of current research in the field of music pedagogy, psychology of creativity, and performing arts.

2. Summary analysis of the dissertation content

The content of the dissertation is presented in three chapters, each of which consistently develops the logic of the study.

The *first* chapter, “Theoretical and methodological foundations for developing creativity in future bachelors of music education during vocal training” is devoted to substantiating the conceptual foundations of the research. Using phenomenological and retrospective analysis methods, the author explores the conceptosphere of creativity, identifying the intersection of theories of divergent and convergent thinking (J. Guilford), insight and bisociation (A. Koestler), the theory of activity and the psychology of performing arts. As a result, the author formulates a convincing and comprehensive definition of creativity in music education, which explains this quality as an integral one, manifested in the unity of cognitive, emotional and performing components. Theoretical analysis allows N. Kuldanov to identify the pedagogical necessity of developing creativity as a professionally significant quality of future bachelors of music education through the discipline of vocal education.

In the *second* chapter, “Modelling the development of creativity in future bachelors of music education during vocal training”, the author substantiates the methodological foundations for the development of creativity. The main pedagogical approaches (pluralistic, iterative, transcendental, participatory) are defined in accordance with the developed component model of the construct under study. Based on well-founded approaches, N. Kuldanov develops a model for the development of creativity, each element of which is clearly aimed at developing a specific component (personal-motivational, artistic-cognitive, perceptual-reflexive, performative-praxiological).

Of particular interest is the author's attention to methods that stimulate divergent thinking, improvisational skills, and expressive interpretation. The methodology is not only theoretically grounded, but also operationalised using specific methods: axiological understanding of artistic phenomena, problematisation of educational tasks, hermeneutic-emotional interpretative analysis, contextual-stylistic improvisation, reflective musical composition, etc. The model of creativity development methodology developed by the dissertation author provides a comprehensive pedagogical toolkit for the practical implementation of the theoretical understanding of the research problem presented in the first chapter.

The *third* chapter, “Methods for developing future bachelors of music education during vocal training, content implementation”, presents the results of an experimental study conducted by the author. The chapter is divided into two subsections, the first of which explains the course of the ascertaining experiment, during which the initial level of creativity of students was diagnosed on the basis of a diagnostic apparatus developed by the author, with criteria and indicators developed taking into account the structure of the creativity under study. The author used original and relevant diagnostic tools, such as determining semantic distance using the Beaty & Johnson (2021) method, self-assessment of creative thinking effectiveness based on the developments of Sloboda, & A. Van Zijl (2011), as well as tests for divergent thinking, assessment of vocal interpretation, and expert evaluation. The second subsection describes the formative stage of the experiment, aimed at testing the effectiveness of the developed methodology. The dissertation describes in detail the process of implementation into the pedagogical process and analysis of the results, in particular, a comparison of the dynamics of the control and experimental groups. Statistical analysis using Fisher's criterion confirmed the validity of the conclusions about the effectiveness of the developed methodology for developing the creativity of future bachelors of music education in the process of vocal training. The experimental part is carefully documented, presenting diagnostics based on both quantitative data and qualitative observations, which significantly strengthens the scientific reliability of the dissertation.

3. Scientific novelty and theoretical significance

Scientific novelty is ensured by the justification of the component structure of creativity of future bachelors of music education, integrating personal-motivational, artistic-cognitive, perceptual-reflexive, and performative-praxiological components; the theoretical development of a pedagogical model for its formation in the process of vocal training based on relevant methodology; the development of a diagnostic apparatus for assessing creativity (value-intentional, musical-professional, organisational-communicative, and result-activity criteria).

The theoretical significance of the research lies in its contribution to the psychology and pedagogy of music education. It broadens the understanding of the conceptosphere of creativity in the context of music education. In particular, the study demonstrates how classical theories (divergent/convergent thinking, bisociation, insight) interact with methodologies focused on music performance and education.

4. Methodological basis and structure

The methodological basis of the dissertation deserves special attention – the application of scientific approaches (pluralistic, iterative, transcendental and participatory) is justified by the peculiarities of the structure of the creativity under study. The dissertation provides a detailed description of how each of these approaches served as the basis for the development of an innovative method aimed at forming a specific element in the content of creativity of future bachelors of music education.

The structure of the dissertation is logical and consistent. Each chapter is devoted to a clearly defined task and contributes to the achievement of the overall goal. A balance is maintained between theoretical discussion and experimental verification.

5. Experimental work and results

The dissertation demonstrates that the experimental work was carried out in stages with the participation of control and experimental groups of students. It is shown that at the ascertaining stage, the use of effective diagnostic tools made it possible to establish a low and uneven level of creativity in both groups, which demonstrated the pedagogical need for intervention. At the formation stage, the author implemented his methodology in the experimental group, while the control group continued to work in the traditional mode.

The results of the study are convincing: the average total Kf of the control group increased only slightly, while the experimental group demonstrated a significant increase in the creativity development coefficient and a decrease in variability. The use of Fisher's criterion confirmed the statistical significance of the differences. Overall, statistical analysis is a strong point of the work, as it demonstrates the author's understanding of methodological rigour and not only reflects average differences but also interprets the distribution of progress among students. In addition, the author supplements the quantitative data with qualitative pedagogical observations, describing specific cases when students moved from a reproductive level to creative approaches.

6. Practical significance, conclusions and recommendations.

The practical significance of the dissertation is substantial. The developed methodical model can be integrated into the educational process of higher music educational institutions, in particular in the training of future teachers of music disciplines.

The methodical recommendations, exercises and diagnostic tools presented in the dissertation can be used by vocal teachers, choir conductors and music teachers. They are applicable both in Kazakhstan and internationally, as the principles of divergent thinking, improvisational flexibility and psychodynamic reframing are universal. The results of the study may also be of interest to developers of training programmes for performing musicians in higher education institutions of culture and art.

Thus, N. Kuldanov's dissertation on "Development of creativity of future bachelors of music education in the process of vocal training" is a complete, independent, and relevant scientific work. It demonstrates clear scientific novelty in the conceptualisation of creativity and the development of a psychodynamically based methodology, methodological rigour combined with in-depth theoretical analysis, experimental research and statistical verification, as well as practical significance for improving the training of future bachelors of music education.

Candidate of Pedagogical Sciences (Ph.D)
Department of Musical Art and Choreography
South Ukrainian National Pedagogical University
named after K.D. Ushynsky



Inha Khmelevska

**Inha
Khmel
evska**

Digitally signed by Inha Khmelevska
DN: C=UA, E=Khmelevska.IO@pdpu.edu.ua,
O=South Ukrainian National Pedagogical
University named after K.D. Ushynsky,
OU=Department of Musical Art and
Choreography, CN=Inha Khmelevska
Reason: I am the author of this document
Date: 06.09.2025 21:53
PDF X Version: 1.4.13